

CONFIDENTIAL

CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
(Directorate of Coordination)

No.CDA-1227/BM-Coord/2012/ Islamabad March 2012.

Subject:- MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF CDA BOARD FOR THE YEAR 2012.

The 5th meeting of the CDA Board for the year 2012 was convened on Tuesday, the 20th March, 2012 at 11.00 A.M in Room No. 006, Jinnah Convention Centre, Islamabad with the Chairman, CDA presiding.

2. The following were in attendance:-

- 1) Engr. Farkhand Iqbal, In Chair
 Chairman, CDA.

- 2) Mr. Javaid Jehangir,
 F.A/ Member.

- 3) Mr. Shaukat Ali Mohmand,
 Member (Admin).

- 4) Mian Waheed-ud-Din,
 Member (Environment).

- 5) Mr. Khalid Mahmood Mirza,
Member (Estate).
- 6) Mr. Abdul Aziz Qureshi,
Member (P & D).
- 7) Mr. Sanaullah Aman,
Member (Engineering).
- 8) Dr. Raja Mustafa Hyder,
Secretary CDA Board.

3 The following officers were in attendance and participated:-

- 1) Mr. Nadeem Akbar Malik,
D.G (Administration), CDA.
- 2) Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Sandhu,
D.G (Planning), CDA.
- 3) Mrs. Najma Azhar,
DDG (HRD), CDA.
- 4) Mr. Shahid Mehmood,
DDG (Water Management), CDA.
- 5) Mr. Faisal Nisar Chaudhary,
Director (Estate Management-I), CDA.

4. Chief Commissioner (ICT), Islamabad and Commissioner, Rawalpindi could not attend the meeting.

5. Meeting commenced with the recitation of “Holy Quran” by Dr. Raja Mustafa Hyder, Secretary CDA Board.

6. The following agenda items were taken up for discussion and following decisions were taken:

6.1 PRESENTATION ON LED LIGHTS IN LIGHT OF DECISION TAKEN BY PLANNING COMMISSION.

10113/1227/BM/12
20-03-'12/5TH

Member (P & D), explained to the Board that National Energy Conservation Centre (ENERCON), Ministry of Environment approached CDA in January, 2010 to replace the conventional public lighting system with LED lights in order to save energy consumption on immediate basis in Islamabad in line with the National Energy Conservation Strategy. The proposed initiative would reduce the CDA electricity consumption by almost 50% and make available the residual power to the national grid.

CDA, based on the international practices, prepared a PC-I at an estimated cost of Rs. 6524.45 million partially funded by own resources (25% internally generated funds/obtaining cash development line-CDL from the Ministry of Finance) and partially funded by ADB (75%). It was envisaged that the saving on account of electricity charges would be routed for re-

payment of the debt financing. The project implementation period was 3 years with project life of 20 years having FIRR 20.60% and EIRR 225%. Owing to progressive indicators, CDA invited Expression of Interest (EOI) in Feb, 2010 from bidders on deferred payment basis (debt financing) whereby six firms submitted their credentials, out of which the following three firms technically and financially qualified:

- i) M/S SITECO
- ii) M/S INFRCON
- iii) M/S OSLO LIGHTING

The clearance from CDA-DWP was solicited for submission of the PC-I to the Planning Commission for approval. The pre-CDWP held in Sept. 2011 recommended the project for consideration of CDWP on the proper PC-I format.

The CDWP considered the project in its meeting held in October, 2011 and decided as under:

“The project was agreed in principle, however, it was recommended that the PC-I of the project be updated and the project completed in phases. Accordingly, a presentation will be made by the sponsors to the Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission after seeking confirmation of funds from ADB”.

The ADB financing facility through MMF-Energy Efficiency Investment Program lapsed due to extra ordinary delays in the

processing. A presentation was made to the Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission in January, 2012 wherein the concept of alternate financing through the deferred payment solution (75% debt financing) was supported. The pre-qualification of bidders was made on the above stated premise.

The CDA Board in its meeting held on 07-03-2012 considered the project for bid confirmation and constituted a technical committee to examine the financial and technical parameters and make recommendations for consideration in the next CDA Board meeting. The committee comprised of Member (P&D), Member (Engineering) and FA/Member, CDA.

The Committee held its meeting and noted that the original documents pertaining to the selection of firm and evaluation of technical and financial bids were not available. The Committee did not have access to the record. Therefore, the onus of selection and evaluation rests with the persons who dealt with this case since its inception and the Committee is unable to substantiate the selection and evaluation process. However, this report is based on the information contained in the PC-I and copies of some documents made available. The Committee has, nevertheless, made the following points for consideration of the CDA Board:

- i) The CDA Board in its 6th meeting held on 08-03-2011 accepted the proposal of the then FA/Member to get the technical proposal and financial plan evaluated from ADB. The Board also agreed in principle to proceed with the matter. The Finance Wing, CDA vide noting of the then FA/Member dated 14-05-2011 and letter No.CDA/SO(FA/M) dated 28-06-2011 confirmed the cost assumptions of M/s Oslo Lighting Solution as the lowest and most responsive bidder. The Engineering Wing was advised to proceed further in accordance with the CDA Board decision and other prescribed procedures. The stated responsive bidder may be advised to make a presentation to the Board on their financial model which is currently not available in the record before issuance of Letter of Intent (LoI).
- ii) According to the CDA Board decision (4) dated 08-03-2011, in the initial phase the scope of the project should be restricted to Sectors F-6, G-6 and G-7 rather than spreading the project to encompass the entire city.
- iii) It will be more feasible in view of CDA's current financial position to implement this project in phased manner because even for initial 25% of the project cost CDA shall have to approach to the Government for funding.
- iv) IESCO may be taken on board in determining the proposed and actual load for impact of the development initiative and to readjust the existing fixed/flat tariff for electricity consumption owing to the initiation of the project.

DECISION

The CDA Board deliberated the summary and discussed the submissions of the Technical Committee constituted in the 4th CDA Board meeting of 2012. It was pointed out that the original record and documentation was not available for scrutiny, however, the reliance has been made on the PC-1 and copies of some documents available in the part file. The project funding includes 25% of the cost by CDA contribution and 75% on deferred payment basis by the bidders. The technical viability of the project was endorsed. The Board also resolved that the implementation of the project would be incumbent upon availability of CDA share of 25% which was not available in view of the existing financial constraints of CDA. The Financial Advisor of M/s OSLO Lighting Solution, the lowest and responsive bidder, made a presentation on the financial model of the company before the Board. The issue of non-availability of original record was also discussed in detail and it was decided that the Member (Engineering), CDA should oversee / monitor the proceedings of the already constituted committee headed by Director Water Supply, CDA for location of the missing file and fixing of responsibility. The Member (Engineering) would ensure submission of the report expeditiously facilitating the Administration Wing to take prompt disciplinary action.

It was decided by the Board that in view of the financial crunch being faced by CDA, Finance Division may be approached for provision of Cash Development Loan (CDL) equivalent to 25% of the project cost and Letter of Intent (LOI) issued by CDA.

Action: Member (Engineering)
F.A / Member
Member (P & D)
Member (Admin)
Director (Water Supply)

6.2 **ALLOTMENT OF PLOT TO SIKANDAR MASIH S/O SOBA MASIH, SEWERMAN (UNINTENTIONAL DEATH IN WORKING HOURS).**

10114/1227/BM/12
 20-03-'12/5TH

DDG Water Management, explained to the Board that on 14-03-2012, a complaint regarding blockage of sewerage network at Sector I-9 was received. A team was deputed to attend the complaint in question. Unfortunately, Mr. Sikandar Masih S/O Suba Masih, Ex-Sewerman while cleaning sewerage manhole has become unconscious due to suffocation. He was immediately pulled out from the manhole by the staff of 1122 Islamabad and rushed to the Capital Hospital in a critical condition but he expired in front of duty Medical Officer of CDA Hospital at 12.30 PM.

In this regard, it is stated that the competent Authority in CDA, i.e. Chairman CDA has directed that a Summary for allotment of plot on deceased employees quota of Prime Minister's Assistance Package 2007 be brought before CDA Board.

In view of the above, he placed the case before the CDA Board for ascertaining approval for allotment of residential plot according to the entitlement in the name of widow of Late Sikandar Masih, Ex-Sewer man.

DECISION

DDG (Water Management) and Director Estate Management-I, presented the facts of the case before the CDA Board. The Board in light of the Prime Minister's Assistance Package for deceased employees approved the allotment of plot to the widow of Sikandar Masih S/o Soba Masih, Ex-Sewer man. The allotment of plot at a suitable location will be finalized by Planning Wing.

**Action: Member (P & D)
Member (Estate)
DDG (Water Management)
Director (E.M-I)**

6.3 **LAND USE PLAN OF SECTOR C-16.**

10115/1227/BM/12
20-03-'12/5TH

DECISION

Land use plan for Sector C-16 was presented by Director General (Planning) before the CDA Board. The Board approved the land use plan for Sector C-16 subject to the following observations:-

- i) Commercial area to be shifted along Margalla Avenue.
- ii) 04 School plots to be created in each Sub-sector.
- iii) 04 Guest house plots to be created in each Sub-sector.
- iv) 04 Sites / plots for Restaurants with adequate parking to be created in each Sub-sector.
- v) Empty pocket of land shown on the C-16 site plan be verified from Estate Wing, so that its exact status is clear to the Board.

The Board directed DG (Planning) to incorporate the above mentioned observations in the land use plan of Sector C-16 and also allocate plot numbers in the same within one week. Land use plan for Sector C-15 is also to be expedited

Action: Member (P & D)
D.G (Planning)

6.4 **ABSORPTION / PERMANENT INDUCTION OF SYED SAJJAD HUSSAIN SHAH, DEPUTY SECRETARY (BS-19) IN THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SECRETARIAT IN CDA AS ITS REGULAR EMPLOYEE AGAINST THE POST OF DIRECTOR (BS-19), EXECUTIVE CADRE, AGAINST DIRECT RECRUITMENT QUOTA POST.**

10116/1227/BM/12
20-03-'12/5TH

DDG (HRD), explained to the Board that the services of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah, Section Officer (BS-18),

National Assembly Secretariat were placed at the disposal of CDA on deputation basis against the post of Deputy Director (BS-18), Executive Cadre, for a period of three years on standard terms & conditions of deputation; vide Section Officer, National Assembly Secretariat, Islamabad Notification No. G (196) / Estt.I (101) dated 29.06.2009. He reported for duty in CDA on 02.07.2009. He was taken on the strength of the Authority on 02.07.2009 and posted as Deputy Director Estate Management Directorate-II. Subsequently, he was assigned the current charge of the higher post of Director Zoo & Wildlife (Environment Cadre) (BS-19) in terms of Regulation 4.33 of CDA Employees (Service) Regulations, 1992.

Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah, Section Officer (BS-18), National Assembly Secretariat; i.e. National Assembly Secretariat was promoted to the post of Deputy Secretary (BS-19) with effect from 4th July, 2011 and he was allowed to continue work in CDA till completion of his usual tenure of deputation of three years. However, on expiry of the tenure he is expected to resume duty as Deputy Secretary (BS-19) in the National Assembly Secretariat vide Notification No. G (196) / Estt.I (159) dated 15.08.2011. The charge assumption report submitted by Syed Sajajd Hussain Shah, against the

post of Director Zoo & Wildlife Management (BS-19) on permanent basis with effect from 04.07.2011 was circulated with the approval of Chairman, CDA.

A request was made to Section Officer, National Assembly Secretariat, Islamabad for obtaining No Objection Certificate for absorption/permanent induction of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah in CDA as its regular employee. Deputy Secretary, National Assembly Secretariat vide letter No. G (196)-Estt.I dated 29.11.2011 has conveyed that National Assembly Secretariat has no objection to permanent induction/absorption of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah, Deputy Secretary (BS-19) as Director (BS-19), Executive Cadre in the Capital Development Authority. Member (Administration) has recorded following remarks on the face of National Assembly Secretariat's letter dated 29.11.2011.

“Please process & put up summary for CDA Board.”

In this regard, it is stated that some officers of the Executive Cadre has lodged a Writ Petition bearing No. 2277/2011 titled “Arif Masaud Ahmed vs FOP” in the court of Law against executive cadre. Judicial Department, Islamabad High Court has granted status quo.

However, the case was forwarded to Barrister Masroor Shah, Chief Legal Advisor for opinion on the case file. He, vide Para 74-77/N of the case file (annexure-A) has advised that the Status Quo order dated 19.08.2011, passed in writ petition No. 2277/2011 does not bar the CDA Board to considered the case of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah in accordance with the law.”

There are total 19 sanctioned posts of Director (BS-19), Executive cadre, out of which 13 posts falls at the share of promotion quota at the ratio of 67% while 06 posts are reserved for initial recruitment quota at the ratio of 33%. Presently, 07 deputationists /direct appointee are on the strength of CDA.

In view of the above, summary regarding absorption/permanent induction of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah, Deputy Secretary (BS-19), National Assembly Secretariat in CDA as its regular employee against the post of Director (BS-19), Executive Cadre, against direct recruitment quota post, may be placed before the CDA Board for consideration, please.

DECISION

DDG (HRD), presented the facts of the case. The CDA Board in light of the revised Order Sheet of Islamabad High Court dated 20-02-2012 in respect to Writ Petition No. 2277 of 2011 in the case of Mr. Arif Masaud Ahmad etc. VS the Federation of Pakistan etc. observed that the Honorable court has maintained the status quo / stay order in the

subject case pertaining to absorption / induction of officers in CDA. Hence the Board did not approve the absorption/ induction of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah as Director (BS-19) Executive Cadre as the same would be in direct conflict with the decision of the Honorable Islamabad High Court in the matter.

Action: DDG (HRD)

6.5 GRANT OF RENTAL CEILING ALONG WITH THE PAY TO THE OFFICERS OF BPS-17 & ABOVE AS IS BEING PAID TO THE EMPLOYEES OF BPS-1 TO 16.

10117/1227/BM/12
20-03-'12/5TH

Director General (Administration), explained to the Board that Islamabad is one of the most beautiful Capitals of the world. 50 years ago no one can even imagine that new Capital of Pakistan will one day become the most beautiful city of the world. It is all due to day & night efforts, provision of meritorious and laborious service by the employees of CDA. They are playing pivotal role in the Planning, development and up keeping the beauty of the city. Presently those employees residing in hired houses seem depressed and stressed due to high rentals.

There are few / limited Official residence available with the Authority and most of the Officers are compelled to live in rented houses. The rent of Private houses in Rawalpindi and Islamabad is increasing day by day and becoming unmanageable.. The rent of a house of even of Two beds rooms in Islamabad is Rs.15,000/- to Rs.18,000/- and the Officers

have to pay the difference of the rent from their own pockets, causing financial burden on them. In the recent past the Authority has taken various steps to boost up the working atmosphere, fringe benefits have been given to the employees including Up-gradation of almost 10000 CDA Employees and other allied steps. All of these steps were beyond the Government Policy as the Authority has full powers to frame its own Rules/Regulations/Policies to suit its smooth functioning. **Under the charter of demand of CBA, the Rental Ceiling of the Officials of BPS-01 to BPS-16 was included in the Salaries of the Employees** to enable them to negotiate with the owners of the Private houses and get suitable place at reasonable rent. Since the Officials and Officers are employees of the same Authority it would be discriminatory if said facility is not extended to the Officers of the Authority.

The proposal will achieve the following financial benefits:-

- i) Staff posted in General Administration Section for hiring of houses can be utilized on other vacant posts.
- ii) The long laborious procedure of Hiring and Payment of Rent, can be avoided and the Manpower, Stationery, Equipment and time of the following Sections could be saved:-
 - a. **General Administration Section**
 - b. **Finance Wing (General).**
 - c. **Office of Accounts Officer Secretariat**

d. Cheque Section

- iii) The Liquidity position of the Authority would also be improved as the Advance Payment of rent would be stopped.
- iv) Income Tax deduction will be effective and it would be beneficial to the Federal Government.
- v) At present, 632 Offices of BPS-17 and above are on Pay Roll, out of which 524 Officers are already availing either Official Accommodation or Hired Houses facility. Only 108 Officers are drawing House rent Allowance. Total Financial Impact involved in the proposal comes to Rs.0.678 Million (PM) and this amount is far lesser than the savings explained in the pre paras. Hence, no Financial Impact is involved.

The case was examined by the Finance Wing (Annex "A") and opined that CDA Board has authority to make its Rules and Regulations and its implementation under Rule-4 of CDA Ordinance 1960 which is re-produced as under:-

“Capital Development Authority Fund” which shall vest in the Authority and shall be utilized by the Authority to meet charges in connection with its functions under this Ordinance including the payment of salaries and other remuneration to the Chairman, Members, Officers, Servants, Experts and Consultants of the Authority”.

CDA will form a fund which shall vest in the authority and shall be utilized to meet expenses in connection with its functions under the Ordinance including payment of salary and other remuneration to the employees of the Authority.

The CDA Board under above mentioned rules has already allowed rental ceiling to CDA employees of BPS-1 to 16 (Non-gazetted / gazetted) by using the power vested in it under the CDA Ordinance 1960. In the light of the said rules, there is no hindrance for allowing rental ceiling to gazetted employees.

Therefore, the case is placed before the Board to allow grant of Rental Ceiling of Islamabad with the Monthly Salaries to the Officers of BPS-17 and above, as is already being paid to the employees of BPS-1 to 16 (Non-gazetted / gazetted). The proposal was examined by Finance Wing and approved by Member Finance.

DECISION

D.G (Administration) presented the facts of the case and Board decided to grant rental ceiling with the monthly salaries to the officers of BPS-17 and above as is already being paid to the employees of BPS-01 to 16 for the removal of discrimination.

Action: D.G (Admin)

6.6 IRREGULAR ENHANCEMENT OF CONTRACT AMOUNTING TO RS. 6.233 (M) PARA NO. 4 FOR THE PERIOD OF 2006-2009 (WAFAQI MOHTASIB).

Due to paucity of time, the above item could not be discussed.

7. The meeting concluded with a word of thanks to and from the Chair.

CONFIDENTIAL**CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY**
(SECRETARIAT)

No.CDA-1227/BM-Coord/2012/ Islamabad March: 2012.

Subject:- MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF THE CDA BOARD FOR THE YEAR 2012.

The 5th meeting of the CDA Board for the year 2012 was convened on Tuesday, the 20th March, 2012 at 11.00 A.M in Room No. 006 at Jinnah Convention Centre, Islamabad with the Chairman, CDA presiding. Draft minutes have been attempted maintaining the highest ethical standards and placed below for the kind perusal and approval of the Board.

(Dr. Raja Mustafa Hyder)
Secretary CDA Board

Member (Environment)

Member (Administration)

Member (Estate)

Member (P & D)

Member (Engineering)

F.A / Member

Chairman

5TH BOARD MEETING FOR THE YEAR-2012

HELD ON 20TH MARCH, 2012**(DRAFT MINUTES)****AGENDA ITEMS**

Sr. #	Items of Agenda	Presenter	Page No
1	Presentation of LED Lights in light of decision taken by Planning Commission. (Discussed).	DG (E & M)	03
2	Allotment of plot to Sikandar Masih S/o Soba Masih, Sewerman (Unintentional death in working hours). (Discussed).	DGG Water Management / Director EM-I	08
3	Land use plan of Sector C-16. (Discussed).	DG (Planning)	10
4	Absorption / permanent induction of Syed Sajjad Hussain Shah, Deputy Secretary (BS-19) in the National Assembly Secretariat in CDA as its regular employee against the post of Director (BS-19), Executive Cadre, against direct recruitment quota post. (Discussed).	DDG (HRD)	10
5	Grant of rental ceiling along with the pay to the officers of BPS-17 & above as is being paid to the employees of BPS-1 to 16. (Discussed).	DG (Admin)	14
6	Irregular enhancement of contract amounting to Rs. 6.233 (M) Para No. 4 for the period of 2006-2009. (Wafaqi Mohtasib). (Not Discussed).	Director E&M (Maint)	18

**6.1 PRESENTATION ON LED LIGHTS IN LIGHT OF DECISION
TAKEN BY PLANNING COMMISSION.**

DECISION

In light of the decision taken in the 4th Board meeting held on 7th March, 2012, the Committee comprising Member (Planning & Design), Member (Engineering) and

F.A / Member submitted their recommendations before the CDA Board. The Board after hearing the submission of the Committee approved the proposal pertaining to replacement of 65000 Conventional Street Lights with light emitting – Diode (LEDs) in Islamabad subject to availability of funds by Finance Division, Government of Pakistan for which approval of the Prime Minister shall be solicited and if the Honorable Prime Minister gives his concurrence, CDA will go ahead with the project. The Board further decided that before the matter is processed further two documents are to be supplied by M/s OSLO namely (i) Evaluation report of financial bid compiled by Financial Adviser of the Company. (ii) M/s OSLO's financial bid. The Board also directed that the Committee headed by Director (Water Supply) expeditiously finalize its findings in the matter of the missing master/ original file of the project and the findings of the inquiry to be submitted to Member (Engineering)) who shall forward the same to Member (Administration) so that the onus of responsibility can be fixed on the concerned officials / officers who have lost the file and disciplinary action can be initiated against them.

Action: Member (Engineering)
F.A / Member
Member (P & D)
Member (Admin)
Director (Water Supply)

